

**California State University, Chico**  
Academic Senate  
(530) 898-6201, Zip 020  
MEMORANDUM

**ACADEMIC SENATE MINUTES**

Thursday, September 24, 2020, 2:30 p.m., ZOOM

*Academic Senate meetings are recorded. Traditionally the written minutes consist of a summary of topics discussed. For more detail, listen to the audio file [here](#). Time stamps for each agenda item are provided in brackets for convenience. CSU, Chico is committed to making its resources accessible for all audiences. If you have accessibility-related difficulties with any of these documents, please email [oats@csuchico.edu](mailto:oats@csuchico.edu).*

**PRESENT:** Adamian, Allen, Bailey, Boyd (Chair), Boura, Buffardi, Burk, Ertle, Ferrari, Ford, Gruber, Herman, Hidalgo, Holbert, Horst, Hutchinson, Irish, Kaiser, Karjl, Larson, Leon, McBride-Praetorius, Medic, Morales-Sanchez, Musvosvi, Ormond, Paiva, Parsons-Ellis, Peterson, Schartmueller, Seipel (Buffardi), Shepherd, Sherman, Sistrunk, Smith, Snyder, Son, Sparks, Teague-Miller, Trailer, Underwood, Wright

**ABSENT:** Altfeld, Millard, Perez

Boyd began to welcome people to the ZOOM meeting and encouraged Senators to note that they are senators on the participants window and guests to note that. She reminded senators there will be an Otter transcript link. She called the meeting to order at 2:37 and shared the agenda with updated links and reports [8:26-9:33]

1. **Approve Minutes of [September 3, 2020](#)** [9:33-10:18]  
Minutes Approved

2. **Approve Agenda** [10:20-19:24]

Boyd pointed out the announcements and the time-certain for the adjournment so that senators can attend the book-in-common event. She asked for objections.

- It was moved to amend the agenda so that the time certain to adjourn would read: " 4:30 pm time certain or earlier to attend Book in Common Event unless discussion of item 6 is not concluded."
- It was hoped that the agenda would be farther along by then and that the Resolution would be fully vetted and brought back if necessary
- It was pointed out that if we do not have a quorum, we will not be able to discuss the Resolution anyway

The motion did not pass.

Ferrari explained that that item 6 can be postponed if necessary and brought back to a later meeting. It does not need to be rushed. Holbert said she thought if there was a delay, it would allow her more time to gather student responses.

Agenda was approved.

### 3. Announcements [19:24-27:07]

- [Book in Common Event: Nandi Sojourner Crosby, "Walking the Talk: Anti-Racist Work in Our Everyday Lives"](#)

Boyd noted that the first event is today at 4:30 and requires registration. Please follow the link.

- [Teaching Racial and Social Justice Series](#) – FDEV (Ferrari)

Ferrari noted that there will be a follow up workshop on pedagogy about the Book in Common that is part of the [Teaching Racial and Social Justice Series](#) tomorrow from 12:00-1:30 with Nandi Crosby. Come and share idea or get them.

- [Getting Prepared for the November 3 Election](#) – AA, Civic Engagement (Schulte)

Ann Schulte, Director of the Office of Civic Engagement, provided an informational memo about where to register to vote, where to vote, all the deadlines to do these, and general ideas about how to encourage students to participate.

- [EDXCHICO](#), begins 9 am on October 9, 2020 – AA

Provost Larson noted that this event has partnered with University Advancement and is joining the [Alumni and Family Weekend](#) taking place from October 9-10. The intention is to engage with the Campus at a virtual homecoming of sorts and present eight presentations with ten different speakers from each college including the Library to showcase the wonderful work and expertise our faculty bring to their teaching. She added that Bre Holbert will be helping her to MC the event.

- The last day for the **Census is September 30**

- **The League of Women Voters of Butte County** will hold a set of **2020 General Election Candidate forums**: *All Forums begin at 6:00pm via Zoom Webinar* A Zoom invitation link for each forum is posted at [www.lwvbutte.org](http://www.lwvbutte.org) *Submit questions to [lwvbutte@gmail.com](mailto:lwvbutte@gmail.com) by midnight two days before the forum date*

- **Tuesday, Sept 29 – Oroville City Council** 3 seats, 7 candidates

Please click the link below to join the webinar:

<https://us02web.zoom.us/j/86156993329?pwd=a1hZSWdFVFJodE5pUlc3Q0VzVjIzUT09>

Passcode: 259157 Or iPhone one-tap: US: +16699006833,,86156993329# or +13462487799,,86156993329#

- **Wednesday, Sept 30 – Chico Area Recreation District** 2 seats, 3 candidates

Please click the link below to join the webinar:

<https://us02web.zoom.us/j/82760668317?pwd=NkZlYW5vRVgyQnJLR25TanIwVk13dz09>

Passcode: 013623 Or iPhone one-tap: US: +16699006833,,82760668317# or +13462487799,,82760668317#

- **Friday, Oct 2 – CA State Assembly District 3** 1 seat, 2 candidates

Please click the link below to join the webinar:

<https://us02web.zoom.us/j/88590578753?pwd=NW5tTGNmSVRwM0NkckU0MThwWXNvZz09>  
9 Passcode: 205285 Or iPhone one-tap: US: +16699006833,,88590578753# or  
+13462487799,,88590578753#

#### 4. **Chair's Prerogative** [27:07-32:19]

Boyd reminded everyone that the Academic Senate is here to shape policy and guidelines on our campus. She noted this happens in a number of ways: proposals can come as draft documents that end up formal recommendations to our President and Cabinet. Although they are members of the senate, they are still the final approving body of most measures that come forward.

Beside recommendations, Senate can be very clear in making resolutions. These are formal ways we document how we feel about a particular subject or our intentions to do something and charge the senate in a different way. Sometimes the EC works out how these charges are assigned to a subcommittee which then reports to the different standing committees or the EC and then goes to the academic senate.

There are different approaches depending on where things originated.

- **How to be heard in Academic Senate**

- i. **Policy drives academic institutions** [How Proposals Move through Academic Senate](#)

- This is a useful diagram of what was just described.

- ii. **Parliamentary procedures and inclusion** [Procedures for Meetings](#)

- Here is guidance about the different ways to make motions.

- iii. **Speakers list and recognition using Zoom**

- For today, we have decided that chat will be available for public use to clarify links or information about what was said. It is useful that items are emailed to secretary Sistrunk or the Academic Senate ([academicsenate@csuchico.edu](mailto:academicsenate@csuchico.edu)). The chat will be used to recognize speakers (so guests should write their names and ask for a senator to recognize them and senator will raise their blue hand and ask for this from the floor).

- Comments should be relevant to the item being discussed. It is also important that people not repeat one another so that we are expeditious with our time.

#### 5. **[Overview of Interim Policy for the Use of Digital Technologies in Teaching and Learning \(EM 20-020\)](#) & [pdf](#) – EC – Information Item (Ferrari)** [32:19-49:00]

Ferrari explained that this discussion is to explain this policy which is very dense and is also very important given our current learning and teaching circumstances. The writers of this policy will give a summary and also resources about its particular dimensions. (look under the [Overview](#) power point above). Different areas of the policy are explained.

[slide 2] Sections 2.2 to 2.5 in the policy are primarily about data and use of software. 2.2.2 and 2.2.3 explain how the ITPR process works and how data collection is supposed to be governed. There are more links to understand how information is categorized and requirements for its use.

[slide 4] Section 2.4 is dedicated to open educational resources, the people to contact, and Faculty Development resources to learn more about affordable learning solutions.

[slide 5] Section 2.5 states the policy for data retention and the slide also provides clarification of its impact.

[slide 6] Section 2.5.3 states the student's rights and responsibilities and [slide 7] articulates their rights to clear communication about learning goals and modes of instruction. [slide 8] states the academic integrity and honesty requirements and [slide 9] preserves their right to clear communication about the modes of instructions and their property rights to their own work.

[slide 10] shows how the policy was organized so that student rights and responsibilities are articulated and so are faculty rights and responsibilities (found under Section 4 of the policy).

[slide 11] this policy under section 4.2 impacts the senate role since curricular control is vested with the faculty and control of programs is the purview of departments, but when a change from face to face to online instruction is contemplated, that is a significant change that must go through the full senate process for review and approval for both state support and self support programs.

[slide 12] discusses section 4.3 accessibility and universal design. Ferrari pointed out that faculty have personal liability when materials are not accessible. (there is an example provided).

[slide 13] section 4.4 notes that the university will provide training and development (the resources available are listed here)

[slide 14] section 4.12 observes that the university will provide guidelines about how to evaluate teaching effectiveness in online instruction (with a list of resources including best practices, and a template rubric to promote effective evaluation).

Questions were addressed:

- Is the provision that records will be kept for students for five years long enough given that some of them have emergencies caused by circumstances that might separate them from their courses for a long while. It was noted that the grading policy we just ratified this semester includes provisions about incompletes and other ways of separating from courses as well as efforts to strengthen the relationship between faculty and advising to mitigate emergencies. These questions can also be considered by subcommittee charged with rewriting the Interim policy.

- 4.1.2 discusses the university's role in providing guidelines and processes for evaluation and does not seem consistent with the FPPP that emphasizes the faculty and department roles in this. It was hoped that the rewriting committee would revisit this language to add the emphasis on the department and personnel committee's importance in this process.
- The Provost's recommendations to FASP about revising the FPPP include this subject matter as well
- Ferrari thought this was a good idea (and that is why the department standards are linked in this section) so that departments will develop their own understandings of this provision for their own subject matter. The passage is also supposed to inform departments that the university has provided resources.
- How do these guidelines (like record retention) compare to processes used for face to face courses. Must all the material from any class be retained for five years? We should not put significantly different expectations on distance learning when compared with face to face.

6. **Draft Resolution: Condemnation of Violence Against Black People and Communities of Color and Commitment to Anti-Racist Practices – EC – Introduction Item [49:00-1:48:56]**

- Supplemental resources shared by the Black Faculty and Staff Association

Boyd reminded senators that this was brought forward as a discussion item last week to make it publicly available and promote responses from the whole campus. Many groups recommended last week have communicated their feedback. They have been asked to come to the meeting today to communicate what they think.

She recognized that there were some concerns with the process by which this resolution was brought forward and she personally apologized. She appreciated the honesty and openness about the issues people expressed. She noted that the student senate representatives brought forward their concerns that some audience members do not feel as privileged to speak as much as others and we will work to trouble-shoot this moving forward.

Boyd said senate officers will watch the chat to acknowledge and recognize guests and senators will do this too. The chat is to recognize speakers as we would in a normal face to face meeting and to clarify a point they already made. This is not part of the formal record and is only facilitating communication.

She reminded people to be succinct and speak to the Resolution clauses specifically. Brief statements of support of previous concrete measures are acceptable but new information is the most helpful. She hoped this conversation could be used as an opportunity to explain why some ideas need to be considered for sensitivity to others so that everyone can learn. She appreciated everyone for their patience and wisdom.

Many people spoke with their constituent bodies since the last meeting and Boyd noted there may be more who need to be contacted. The intention is to assign the work of coordinating the suggestions to a subcommittee so that the Resolution captures our intentions moving forward. Because this is an introduction item today, conversation is to suggest changes for the future.

Individuals and representatives of others offered or sent comments:

- The blended ethnicities people have should be recognized
- “Black” should be capitalized throughout the document
- Please explicitly include the MCGS Chair (currently Susan Green), who heads the UDC Working Group on social justice across the curriculum. Consider resolving to support the refining and implementation of the rubric that the working group created last year to measure courses and programs.

Dawn Frank, Chair of the Black Faculty and Staff Association noted that BFSA had replied to many who reached out for feedback. She said there are about 42 Black identified faculty and staff on campus and BFSA has about 12-15 active members. Beside the **BFSA Strategic Planning 2018-19 specific goals included in the agenda** above, she offered some specific comments;

- Considering the title, they are asking the Black lives, Black voices and Black Faculty and Staff at this University be centered
- 1<sup>st</sup>, 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Whereas clauses should make clear the killings were done by the police:  
1<sup>st</sup> Whereas clause: “...killings by the police of many...”  
2<sup>nd</sup> Whereas clause: “...violence by the police carried out...”  
3<sup>rd</sup> Whereas clause: “killings of Black people by the police in our country...”
- Under the 1<sup>st</sup> resolution clause, include more Black women and Black Transgender individuals
- 6<sup>th</sup> resolution clause: “commit, though the help of programs” Should name the programs including but not limited to: the GE Advisory Board, Office of Diversity and Inclusion, and the AS Government Affairs Diversity Committee,
- 7<sup>th</sup> resolution clause: Include a representative from each of the following affinity groups: the BFSA, Chicano Latino Council, Asian Pacific Islander Council, and Native American Faculty and Staff Association and others as needed (like an LGBTQ affinity group).
- 10<sup>th</sup> resolution clause: this should find some way to include recognition that Black staff also suffer cultural taxation and are not recompensed in this service related work. They too lack guidance, time and opportunities for release for the additional roles they play
- 13<sup>th</sup> resolution clause. Update the language “CSU Chico commit to support mentorship programs to prepare and recruit Black faculty and staff such as the CSU Chancellor’s Doctoral Incentive Program, the National Undergraduate Fellowship and the Adelante...”
- 14<sup>th</sup> resolution clause: “...commit to reading such texts as the book in common...similar works, and give evidence that these are being applied, and be it further”
- There is an additional list of texts that could be added as a good start- the BFSA has resources listed in the Supplemental resources listed above

- The BFSA Strategic Planning for 2018-19 and the Strategic Planning for 2014-15 have very specific tangible goals that could be included in the Resolution as well

Adamian noted that the recommendations for development and resources passed by BSFA over the last six years have not been met. She said our Resolution should include the ongoing funding called for in the two Strategic Planning documents referenced above and we should wonder why these practical support strategies for Black faculty and staff have not been implemented yet.. She suggested two new resolution clauses and will send more edits:

- After the third resolution clause we should add two clauses.
- 1<sup>st</sup> whereas clause: alphabetize the names
- Use the word “murders” throughout the document instead of “killing” because the legal language here is rooted in white 4<sup>th</sup> resolution clause (top of page 2): “promotion processes that take consideration of alternative pedagogies...that fundamentally represents the diverse cultures of people of color”.... We condemn...promote an diverse employee pool of Black people ;”....”
- 6<sup>th</sup> resolution clause: “...Black people in ~~American~~ US society and ~~to~~ toward embracing.....”
- 10<sup>th</sup> resolution clause (line 2): “...Black scholars ~~and other faculty of color.~~”

Ford read some feedback from faculty including Asa Mittman.

- 7<sup>th</sup> resolution clause, second line replace “request” with “demand”
- The charge of this committee should be to “drastically reduce the presence of the Police on campus and reduce their functions to unarmed staff as much as possible”
- Smith thought Marc Thompson’s name should be included among those who suffered violence because he was a student here
- Bailey pointed out that the word “murder” and not “killing” was used in earlier versions of the Resolution and should be listened to as other groups are speaking out
- He also said we should replace the Police Department with a Security and Logistics Department who are unarmed at public events and use the additional funding to hire more counsellors

Bailey read the ideas of the Student for Quality Education

- “Resolved, That the CSU, Chico Academic Senate recommends the establishment of a mutual aid program in place of the blue light program that utilizes community support from students, staff, and faculty over aid from security agencies; and therefore be it
- Resolved, That the CSU, Chico Academic Senate recommends the creation of a student and faculty oversight committee that oversees the reappropriation of campus resources from campus police to student-centric resources; and therefore be it
- Resolved, That the CSU, Chico Academic Senate recommends the creation of a Black student resource center on campus, using re-allocated funds from the University Police Department to implement anti-racist, mandatory, extensive, and regular unconscious bias training led by trusted

organizations chosen by BIPOC faculty and students for the entire campus community , and therefore be it

- Resolved, That the CSU, Chico Academic Senate recommends mandatory anti-racist trainings throughout all administration departments and auxiliaries, including University Housing, Cabinet, Associated Students, Business and Finance, Student Affairs, etc.; and therefore be it”

Trailer did not read the feedback he gathered because it was so lengthy. He said his constituents acknowledge that the resolution has a noble intent, but that it does more harm than good. There was no support for it. There is an alternative draft proposed at the top of the document.

Kelli Schiess, University Housing thought that all the Resolution clauses should include some kind of timeline with a commitment to a deadline. Should say how often policies will be reviewed or changed. This will keep things from being lost or pushed off for later.

Kaiser suggested splitting the resolution so that part deals with police violence against Black people and the rest dealing with the other groups treated by AB 1460.

Bailey thought as Chair of the Chicano council that his constituency recognizes that they will not be safe until Black Lives Matter. This is an opportunity to center change that will benefit us all. Kelli Schliess agreed because this violent racism is a public health problem and thought we can move on to Resolutions centering Native Americans or Chicanx folks and others as well.

Boyd explained that the feedback received will be collected and a subcommittee formed to weave it all together into a draft for the whole senate to vote on at Action when we are ready. It probably won't be ready for consideration until the October 22 senate meeting especially because some of the student groups must weigh in with their input.

Boyd asked senators for suggestions about who should be on this subcommittee and asked senators to send their ideas by the end of the day so we can discuss forming it at EC on Friday. This process is unusual because EC wanted to be sure everyone could speak who wanted to and no one's ideas would not be heard.

Adamian shared some of her other responses:

- We should investigate whether the Academic Student Senate wants to join us in a joint resolution as we did last Spring.
- 1<sup>st</sup> Whereas clause: could add “police and non-state violence against Black people” so that we could add Marc Thompson’s name to the list
- The 2nd Whereas clause should say: “...US ~~justice-legal~~ legal system...”
- 3rd whereas clause: change “killings” to “murders” so the clause should read: “The ~~killings~~ murder of Black people in our country the United States are not...symptoms of the structural, systemic white supremacy”



- 4<sup>th</sup> Whereas clause: add “...safety policies and practices for oppressed peoples by President...”
- 1<sup>st</sup> Whereas clause and 1<sup>st</sup> resolution clause include Black women, Black transgender names
- 3<sup>rd</sup> resolution clause: change “response to such cruelty “ to “response to institutional, systemic and structural racism”; cut word “identify” so that we think of more results driven language
- 4<sup>th</sup> resolution clause: change “alternative pedagogies” to “consideration of racial and social justice and centering of Black scholarship and contributions within the academy...” We need to center some recognition of staff here as well. We need to name Eurocentric practices within this same clause.
- 6<sup>th</sup> resolution clause: change word “help” to “support” throughout the document
- Wherever community stakeholders or community members are named we should be more explicit
- if word “tolerance” is used it should be changed
- 10<sup>th</sup> resolution clause: add staff cultural taxation language
- Adamian thought our choice of readings should be tied to their use in policy making and shifting of practice

Melyse Bonifacio-Jerez (Students for Quality Education), wanted all the senators to be mindful of the feedback they were getting from Black faculty, staff and students. We don’t have time to wait anymore. We need anti-racist practice now. You should meet until this task is finished.

Catherine Lemmi, School of Education brought some suggestions that she and her colleague thought about to add parenthetical information that might clarify some of the theoretical language.

- 3<sup>rd</sup> Whereas clause: after “institution” add “(for example policing, justice systems, healthcare, education and housing)” This shows that oppressions are interlinked
- 4<sup>th</sup> resolution clause: add “(as such, we also commit to the use of theoretical tools such as critical race theory to help our campus continue to learn how to identify and interrogate situational and structural white supremacy and racism)”
- 6<sup>th</sup> resolution clause: add parenthetical after “oppressive pedagogy” “(such as ‘no tolerance’ policy, Eurocentric curricula, ‘one-size fits all practices’ and exclusionary discipline)”

Snyder reported that AS as a whole is considering writing their own resolution and will perhaps be too involved to join in ours. But she will find more information and query just the Student Academic Senate.

Boyd reminded senators to continue to send their suggestions to officers via email and copy Boyd. The goal is that we can earn trust that we are taking this seriously.

Introduction Item passed. (36 in favor and no opposition)

## 7. Standing Committees Reports [1:48:56-1:50:42]

- **Educational Policies and Programs Committee – Allen**  
Allen offered to answer questions. She warned senators they will be receiving 20 GE minor proposals all at once very soon.
- **Faculty and Student Policies Committee – Underwood**  
The report is attached and Underwood offered to answer questions.
- **Committee on Committees – Paiva**  
Paiva reported that the permanent committee appointment letters will be sent tomorrow and early into next week.
- **Executive Committee – Sistrunk**  
Sistrunk admitted they EC had had one meeting since the last Senate meeting. Questions will e answered.

8. **Statewide Academic Senate Report – Ford/Boyd <http://www.calstate.edu/AcadSen/> [1:50:43-1:52:36]**

- **ASCSU Agendas, Minutes, Resolutions, & Summaries**
- **Faculty Trustee CSU Board of Trustees reports**

Ford reported that the Board of Trustees named Joseph Castro ax the new Chancellor. He is from Fresno State where he was President since 2013 and will take office in January 2021

Last week our own AS President Bre Holbert was named as Trustee Emeritus Scholar (clapping happened with open mics across the senate wherever they are)

Betsy Boyd will join the Faculty Trustee recommending committee of the ASCSU.

Ford reserved the rest of the report until the next senate meeting as there will be no other state-wide meetings before that.

9. **University Reports – Hutchinson/Larson/Sherman/Boura/Parsons [1:52:36-2:05:21]**

**Hutchinson** said she is grateful and appreciative about this conversation that we had today and at the last senate meeting. This Resolution is important and the actions that we take this year at the University are even more important.

She acknowledged the Black Faculty and Staff Association and acknowledge that the Cabinet did receive the Strategic Plan of 14-15 and of 18-19. She noted that there are things we have achieved and others we have not. We need better communication established to discuss these developments and work together, not only with the BFSA but other communities of color. She said she has taken note and will address these issues in Cabinet right away.

She said she is putting together that Presidential taskforce to approach these complex questions about Policing and examining Campus safety and security. She said she took very good notes

during the discussion about who should be included on that taskforce. She has identified someone who she thinks will be a very good external facilitator. She intends to bring a very balanced group onto this campus that can examine the challenges carefully. She hopes to move beyond her white privilege and the systemic racism of our institutions to have true consultation. She is committed to doing this in an inclusive, integrated and intersectional way.

The timeline will be that we will start in mid-October and conclude by the first of April. We will need to have presentation made across the campus, to the senate, to others and to the Cabinet and to her.

She was grateful for all the conversation today and to Boyd and the Executive Committee of the senate that is helping to create this space with all of you so that we can have these conversations.

She said there are planning teams in place that are beginning to consider what the Spring semester may look like as we continue to be predominately virtual in our instruction and everything else. These plans will solidify before priority registration opens at the end of October.

**Larson** observed that AB 1460 was signed into law and CAB has initiated some work on this following the CO's lead. The ASCSU has consulted with the Ethnic Studies Council and they have made good progress on establishing\ common SLOs. There will be activity as we think about what our adaptation of the law will look like.

We are currently conducting two internal searches

- Permanent Dean of HFA
- Interim AVP for International Education and Global Engagement

We are coming up on the season to nominate faculty for outstanding performance awards. Announcements have been sent out and Academic Affairs will really promote this next week as well with the Department Chairs and the leaders of the Division.

**Sherman** reminded everyone that it is open enrollment time. Make sure if you have any sign-ups you do with healthcare reimbursement accounts, these are annual and must be renewed every year. There have been changes with plans and offerings that the CSU provides. Please spread the word so everyone signs up.

**Parsons-Ellis** noted that they are managing the pivot in Housing. There are less than 100 students living at University Village. The division is continuing to strategize about ways to serve and support and engage our students. Student Affairs is starting to look at the Spring in the light of lesson learned this Fall so they can do a better job.

**Boura** reported that University Advancement is working hard on getting ready for Alumni weekend on October 9-10. Many faculty, students and staff across the University will showcase our campus in a virtual format. Boura showed a short film that gave an overview of everything that will be going on over the two days.

Boyd noted that the senate meeting will conclude with this entertainment.

[Items 10-13 were delayed because of the shortened meeting]

10. **Adjourn** – 4:30 pm time certain or earlier to attend Book in Common Event [2:05:21]

The meeting adjourned at 4:33.

Respectfully submitted,  
Tim Sistrunk, Secretary