Why a Rubric for Online Instruction?

Laura Sederberg
CSU, Chico
March 2004
Reasons

1. How to Develop High Quality Learning Environments (HQLE)?
2. Faculty Development
3. Best Use of Academic Technologies
How we got started

- Formed a committee
- Committee “charge”
- Objectives
- Resulting Rubric
- Exemplary Online Instruction Awards
Committee for Online Instruction

Volunteers

• Faculty
• Staff
• Administrators
• Students
Committee Charge

“The CSU, Chico Office of the Provost and the Center for Excellence in Learning and Teaching wishes to recognize and encourage the development of exemplary online instruction for students. To that end the Committee for Online Instruction (COI) is charged with developing an evaluation tool to assess the quality of online courses and a nomination process for recognizing instruction as exemplary.”
Objectives

- To evaluate existing online courses (and course components)
- To help design and develop new online courses
- To serve as a vehicle for recognizing faculty excellence in online instruction
Rubric for Online Instruction

• Research; comparison of other evaluation tools; review of Chickering & Gamson’s “7 Principles for Good Practice in Undergraduate Education”

• WebCT’s Exemplary Course Project

• Our own rubric
Exemplary Online Instruction Awards

• Nominations opened, fall of 2002
• Sub-committee reviewed, spring of 2003
• Met with nominees, summer of 2003
• Rubric was “refined” through this process of first implementation
• CELT Conference announced awards
Next Steps

- Award winners asked to serve as mentors
- Some to sit on next review committee
- Workshops train how to use Rubric
  - CSU, Chico; CVC (community colleges); WebCT Annual Users Pre-Conference session
- CSU system-wide implementation plan considered, crossing WebCT to Blackboard through a TIGERS Grant
Rubric for Online Instruction

- Learner Support & Resources
- Innovative Teaching with Technology
- Online Organization & Design
- Assessment & Evaluation
- Faculty Use of Student Feedback
- Instructional Design & Delivery
# Rubric for Online Instruction

## Category 1: Learner Support & Resources

### Baseline
- A. Course contains limited information for online learners and links to campus resources.
- B. Course provides limited course-specific resources.
- C. Course offers access to a limited number of resources supporting course content.

### Effective
- A. Course contains extensive information about campus resources.
- B. Course provides a variety of course-specific resources, content for instructor, department and program.
- C. Course offers access to a wide range of resources supporting course content.

### Exemplary
- A. Course contains limited information and links to campus resources.
- B. Course provides extensive course-specific resources, contact information for instructor, department and program.
- C. Course offers access to a wide range of resources supporting course content.

## Category 2: Online Organization & Design

### Baseline
- A. Course is not organized and navigable.
- B. Course syllabus does not present course information clearly.
- C. Most web pages are visually and functionally consistent.

### Effective
- A. Course is organized and navigable.
- B. Course syllabus identifies and clarifies the role the online environment will play in the course.
- C. Most web pages are visually and functionally consistent.

### Exemplary
- A. Course is well-organized and easy to navigate.
- B. Course syllabus identifies and clarifies the role the online environment will play in the course.
- C. Most web pages are visually and functionally consistent.

## Category 3: Instructional Design & Delivery

### Baseline
- A. Course offers limited opportunities for interaction and communication.
- B. Course goals are not clearly defined and do not align to learning objectives.
- C. Course provides visual, textual, kinesthetic and/or auditory activities to enhance student engagement.

### Effective
- A. Course offers several opportunities for interaction and communication.
- B. Course goals are clearly defined and aligned to learning objectives.
- C. Course provides a variety of visual, textual, kinesthetic and/or auditory activities to enhance student engagement.

### Exemplary
- A. Course offers multiple opportunities for interaction and communication.
- B. Course goals are clearly defined and aligned to learning objectives.
- C. Course provides multiple visual, textual, kinesthetic and/or auditory activities to enhance student engagement.

## Category 4: Assessment & Evaluation of Student Learning

### Baseline
- A. Course has limited activities to assess student readiness for course content and mode of delivery.
- B. Learning objectives, instructional and assessment activities are not clearly aligned.
- C. Assessments are aligned to course content and mode of delivery.

### Effective
- A. Course has multiple activities to assess student readiness for course content and mode of delivery.
- B. Learning objectives, instructional and assessment activities are clearly aligned.
- C. Assessments are aligned to course content and mode of delivery.

### Exemplary
- A. Course has multiple activities to assess student readiness for course content and mode of delivery.
- B. Learning objectives, instructional and assessment activities are clearly aligned.
- C. Assessments are aligned to course content and mode of delivery.

## Category 5: Innovative Teaching with Technology

### Baseline
- A. Course uses limited technology tools to facilitate communication and learning.
- B. New teaching methods are applied to enhance student learning.
- C. Multimedia elements and learning objects are limited or non-existent.

### Effective
- A. Course uses some technology tools to facilitate communication and learning.
- B. New teaching methods are applied to creatively enhance student learning.
- C. Multimedia elements and learning objects are applied and are relevant to student learning.

### Exemplary
- A. Course uses a variety of technology tools to support effective communication and learning.
- B. New teaching methods are applied to creatively enhance student learning.
- C. Multimedia elements and learning objects are applied and are relevant to student learning.

## Category 6: Faculty Use of Student Feedback

### Baseline
- A. Instructor offers limited opportunities for students to give feedback.
- B. Instructor uses student feedback in an arbitrary way.
- C. Instructor uses student feedback to inform course changes.

### Effective
- A. Instructor offers multiple opportunities for students to give feedback.
- B. Instructor uses student feedback to inform course changes.
- C. Instructor uses student feedback to improve the course.

### Exemplary
- A. Instructor offers multiple opportunities for students to give feedback.
- B. Instructor uses student feedback to inform course changes.
- C. Instructor uses student feedback to improve the course.

---

**New Category**
Rubric for Online Instruction

Three Ratings:

- **Baseline** – Basic start
- **Effective** – OK... pretty good
- **Exemplary** – Outstanding; excellent
Rubric for Online Instruction

• Let’s look at some examples
• Screen-shots grabbed from each course awarded as “exemplary”
• Photos of instructors were taken to personalize; posters created
• Let’s look by category...
## Learner Support & Resources

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category 1</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Effective</th>
<th>Exemplary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Learner Support &amp; Resources</strong></td>
<td>A. Course contains limited information for online learner support and links to campus resources.</td>
<td>A. Course contains some information for online learner support and links to campus resources.</td>
<td>A. Course contains extensive information about being an online learner and links to campus resources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B. Course provides limited course-specific resources, limited contact information for instructor, department and/or program.</td>
<td>B. Course provides some course-specific resources, some contact information for instructor, department and program.</td>
<td>B. Course provides a variety of course-specific resources, contact information for instructor, department and program.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C. Course offers access to a limited number of resources supporting course content.</td>
<td>C. Course offers access to some resources supporting course content.</td>
<td>C. Course offers access to a wide range of resources supporting course content.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
EXEMPLARY

Learner Support & Resources

Public Information page includes important information about being an online student, prerequisites, course overview, and instructor contact information. Course replicates the public information page on the Homepage and provides a variety of course-specific resources to enhance student learning online.

Jim Jacob

Political Science 141: International Relations

Accessibility issues are addressed in the course. A link is provided to DBS.

Cris Guenter

Course provides a variety of resources to enhance online student learning: tutorials, learning objects, links, plug-ins.

Jim Jacob
EXEMPLARY

Learner Support & Resources

Syllabus includes direct links to learner resources.

Molecular Visualization Tools

Course provides a variety of course-specific resources to enhance student learning online.

Course offers access to a range of resources appropriate to discipline, such as links, plugins, and learning objects.

Jeff Bell

Pat Smiley
# Online Organization & Design

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category 2</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Effective</th>
<th>Exemplary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Online Organization &amp; Design</strong></td>
<td>A. Much of the course is under construction, with some key components identified such as the syllabus.</td>
<td>A. Course is organized and navigable. Students can understand the key components and structure of the course.</td>
<td>A. Course is well-organized and easy to navigate. Students can clearly understand all components and structure of the course.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B. Course syllabus is unclear about what is expected of students.</td>
<td>B. Course syllabus identifies and delineates the role the online environment will play in the course.</td>
<td>B. Course syllabus identifies and clearly delineates the role the online environment will play in the total course.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C. Aesthetic design does not present and communicate course information clearly.</td>
<td>C. Aesthetic design presents and communicates course information clearly.</td>
<td>C. Aesthetic design presents and communicates course information clearly throughout the course.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D. Web pages are inconsistent both visually and functionally.</td>
<td>D. Most web pages are visually and functionally consistent.</td>
<td>D. All web pages are visually and functionally consistent throughout the course.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E. Accessibility issues are not addressed.</td>
<td>E. Accessibility issues are briefly addressed.</td>
<td>E. Accessibility issues are addressed throughout the course.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Political Science 141: International Relations

Dr. James Jacob
jacob@crc.or.edu

This text box will be regularly updated to direct you to any changes that have been made in the course during the semester. Be sure to check it regularly.

Homepage is well-organized and easy to follow.
Syllabus is easily identified and clearly delineates the role the online environment will play in the total course.
Aesthetic design effectively presents and communicates course information.
Accessibility issues are addressed.
There is consistency in all aspects of the entire course.

Jim Jacob

Patricia Smiley

Online Organization & Design

Course is well-organized and easy to follow.
Role of the online environment is clearly delineated.
Aesthetic design effectively presents and communicates course information.
There is consistency in all aspects of the course.

PERFORMANCE OBJECTIVES

Module 1: "Introduction to Dance"

- Performance Objectives
- Assessment Strategies
- What is Dance?
- What is Jazz?
- What is Modern Dance?

PHED 152
Introduction to Dance

Table of Contents
1. Module 1: "Introduction to Dance"
2. Module 2: "Rhythm in Dance"
3. Module 3: "Dance and Movement"
4. Module 4: "Dance and Emotion"
5. Module 5: "Dance in Context"

Online Organization & Design

Click on the photo to view the introductory movie.
Online Organization & Design

Homepage is well organized.
Course is easy to navigate.
Aesthetic design effectively presents course information.
There is consistency in all aspects of the entire course.

Janja Lalich

Cris Guenter
# Instructional Design & Delivery

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category 3</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Effective</th>
<th>Exemplary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Instructional Design &amp; Delivery</strong></td>
<td>A. Course offers limited opportunity for interaction and communication student to student, student to instructor and student to content.</td>
<td>A. Course offers some opportunities for interaction and communication student to student, student to instructor and student to content.</td>
<td>A. Course offers ample opportunities for interaction and communication student to student, student to instructor and student to content.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B. Course goals are not clearly defined and do not align to learning objectives.</td>
<td>B. Course goals are defined but may not align to learning objectives.</td>
<td>B. Course goals are clearly defined and aligned to learning objectives.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C. Learning objectives are vague or incomplete and learning activities are absent or unclear.</td>
<td>C. Learning objectives are identified and learning activities are implied.</td>
<td>C. Learning objectives are identified and learning activities are clearly integrated.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D. Course provides few visual, textual, kinesthetic and/or auditory activities to enhance student learning.</td>
<td>D. Course provides some visual, textual, kinesthetic and/or auditory activities to enhance student learning.</td>
<td>D. Course provides multiple visual, textual, kinesthetic and/or auditory activities to enhance student learning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E. Course provides limited or no activities to help students develop critical thinking and/or problem-solving skills.</td>
<td>E. Course provides some activities to help students develop critical thinking and/or problem-solving skills.</td>
<td>E. Course provides multiple activities that help students develop critical thinking and problem-solving skills.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Jeff Bell

Contributor to MERLOT
Lee Altier

Cris Guenter
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category 4</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Effective</th>
<th>Exemplary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Assessment &amp; Evaluation of Student Learning</td>
<td>A. Course has limited activities to assess student readiness for course content and mode of delivery.</td>
<td>A. Course has some activities to assess student readiness for course content and mode of delivery.</td>
<td>A. Course has multiple timely and appropriate activities to assess student readiness for course content and mode of delivery.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B. Learning objectives, instructional and assessment activities are not closely aligned.</td>
<td>B. Learning objectives, instructional and assessment activities are somewhat aligned.</td>
<td>B. Learning objectives, instructional and assessment activities are closely aligned.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C. Assessment strategies are used to measure content knowledge, attitudes and skills.</td>
<td>C. Ongoing strategies are used to measure content knowledge, attitudes and skills.</td>
<td>C. Ongoing multiple assessment strategies are used to measure content knowledge, attitudes and skills.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D. Opportunities for students to receive feedback about their own performance are infrequent and sporadic.</td>
<td>D. Opportunities for students to receive feedback about their own performance are provided.</td>
<td>D. Regular feedback about student performance is provided in a timely manner throughout the course.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E. Students’ self-assessments and/or peer feedback opportunities are limited or do not exist.</td>
<td>E. Students’ self-assessments and/or peer feedback opportunities exist.</td>
<td>E. Students’ self-assessments and peer feedback opportunities exist throughout the course.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Political Science 141: International Relations

EXEMPLARY

Assessment & Evaluation

Learning objectives and instructional and assessment strategies are closely aligned.

Students' self-assessment and peer feedback opportunities exist.

Opportunities exist for students to give feedback to the instructor about teaching strategies, learning activities, assignments, and online course features.

Political Science 141: International Relations

The Online Group Project: Mediation of the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict

The Online Group Project: Mediation of the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict. The purpose of this project is to give you the opportunity to work in teams. You will have to research, plan, and design an Israeli-Palestinian negotiation, and then interact with the opposing teammates to bring the conflict to a resolution. The criteria for assessment is a combination of the達 成度 of your project, the team work, and your own participation. You will do some small individual research on the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, read about the history of the conflict, and prepare a short presentation on your own. In addition, you will have to participate in the online discussion and the virtual meeting with other students on your team in your private chat room. Over a period of several weeks, I expect you to meet together regularly and develop a course strategy to use all the information that you have gathered to complete your project. You can open an online chat board in Blackboard, which represents each side, and the Blackboard Project Group.

Jim Jacob

Cris Guenter
Assessment & Evaluation of Student Learning

Student feedback is regularly integrated into the instructional design of the course.

Food Forever allows students to give feedback during each course module in the form of a WebCT survey.

Nacer Bellaloui
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category 5</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Effective</th>
<th>Exemplary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Innovative Teaching with Technology</td>
<td>A. Course uses limited technology tools to facilitate communication and learning.</td>
<td>A. Course uses some technology tools to facilitate communication and learning.</td>
<td>A. Course uses a variety of technology tools to appropriately facilitate communication and learning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B. New teaching methods are applied to enhance student learning.</td>
<td>B. New teaching methods are applied to innovatively enhance student learning.</td>
<td>B. New teaching methods are applied and innovatively enhance student learning, and interactively engage students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C. Multimedia elements and/or learning objects are limited or non-existent.</td>
<td>C. Multimedia elements and/or learning objects are used and are relevant to student learning.</td>
<td>C. A variety of multimedia elements and/or learning objects are used and are relevant to student learning throughout the course.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D. Course uses Internet access and engages students in the learning process.</td>
<td>D. Course optimizes Internet access and effectively engages students in the learning process.</td>
<td>D. Course optimizes Internet access and effectively engages students in the learning process in a variety of ways throughout the course.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Rubric for Online Instruction, CSU, Chico, Copyright 2003
Rev. 9/01/03
Appropriate & Effective Use of Technology

Technology is used innovatively to enhance student learning. Multimedia elements including video, DVD, and Shockwave animations are relevant, optimized for student Internet users and effectively engage students in the learning process.

Sample Family History of Dance

EXEMPLARY

NetTutor™ v5.1
A variety of technology tools are used appropriately and effectively, such as NetTutor, an external application for Math108C. A tutorial is provided.

Patricia Smiley

Neil Portnoy
# Faculty Use of Student Feedback

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category 6</th>
<th>Baseline</th>
<th>Effective</th>
<th>Exemplary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Faculty Use of Student Feedback</strong></td>
<td>a. Instructor offers limited opportunity for students to give feedback to faculty on course content.</td>
<td>a. Instructor offers some opportunities for students to give feedback on course content.</td>
<td>a. Instructor offers multiple opportunities for students to give feedback on course content.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Instructor offers limited opportunity for students to give feedback on ease of online technology in course.</td>
<td>b. Instructor offers some opportunities for students to give feedback on ease of online technology in course.</td>
<td>b. Instructor offers multiple opportunities for students to give feedback on ease of online technology in course.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Instructor uses student feedback at the end of the semester to help plan instruction and assessment of student learning for the next semester.</td>
<td>c. Instructor requests and uses student feedback a couple times during the semester to help plan instruction and assessment of student learning for the rest of the semester.</td>
<td>c. Instructor uses formal and informal student feedback in an ongoing basis to help plan instruction and assessment of student learning throughout the semester.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**New Category**
New Category

- Faculty Use of Student Feedback was added to the Rubric after having discussions with faculty nominees.
- Earlier version of Rubric included feedback criteria per categories 1-5.
- Refined Rubric changed all that.
- No examples yet to show...
Resources

ROI Web site
http://www.csuchico.edu/celt/roi

Rubric for Online Instruction
http://www.csuchico.edu/tlp/webct/rubric/

Laura Sederberg
lsederberg@csuchico.edu